

UPSCprep Free Daily Answer Writing Initiative

Subject: GS 4

Syllabus: Case Study

Questions

Q1. A minister's son was driving a car rashly which was stopped by a traffic constable at an intersection. Suspecting the case is of drink and drive, he subjects the boy to a breathalyzer. The test came out positive but in the meantime the boy made some phone calls and also slapped the constable. Constable stayed calm, took him to the police station and the moment SHO started registering FIR, he received a call from his superior to release the boy without any arrest or fine.

Analyze the situation from different perspectives and explain what action SHO should take ?
(250 words) 20

Q2. Mrs Priya is posted as High commissioner of the Indian embassy in Australia. Implementing government programs and acknowledging achievements related to the Indian diaspora is part of her job profile. A media house has invited her to an event to launch a book, which is within protocol.

She accepts the invitation and reaches the venue only to find out that there's a person named Mr Maheshwar in the event who is a friend of the author. Mr Maheshwar is a proclaimed financial fraud declared by various agencies in India. He has a non-bailable warrant against him, and the government is taking steps to extradite him.

Presence of Mr Maheshwar has put Mrs Priya in a fix and indecision. Analyze the situation and explain the course of action to be taken by her. Below are some suggested options. Evaluate the merits and demerits of them-

- Talk to higher authorities in India and take action accordingly.
- Ignore Mr Maheshwar and attend the function.

- Leave function immediately and issue notice against publishing house.
- Talk with Mr Maheshwar and persuade him to return to India.

(250 words)

20

Model Structures

Q1. A minister's son was driving a car rashly which was stopped by a traffic constable at an intersection. Suspecting the case is of drink and drive, he subjects the boy to a breathalyzer. The test came out positive but in the meantime the boy made some phone calls and also slapped the constable. Constable stayed calm, took him to the police station and the moment SHO started registering FIR, he received a call from his superior to release the boy without any arrest or fine. Analyze the situation from different perspectives and explain what action SHO should take ?

(Answer in 250 words)

Model structure

Introduction

- The case presents difficulty faced by officers in performing their duty where powerful people try to circumvent and violate rule of law.
- Values and issues involved-
 - Upholding rules and laws.
 - Safety of the general public due to rash driving.
 - Integrity vs personal well being of constable and SHO.
 - Courage and dedication to duty.
 - De-motivation of officers involved.
 - Equality before law and rule of law.
 - Setting precedent to follow or violate rules.
 - Inner conscience vs external authority.
- In this situation, SHO will be in a dilemma whether to uphold the rule of law or listen to the oral orders of superior. Both choices have merits and demerits. SHO will be under

pressure from his conscience to act objectively, impartially and with integrity. Handling such pressure is part of his duty and he should not succumb to external pressure.

- Not filing the case is against law and the image of the traffic department will also be tarnished. Also, the order is not in writing and any future exposure will put the SHO and his job in jeopardy.
- But departmental structure and integrity stays intact if juniors obey the commands of superiors. Also, not following the orders may impact his future promotions and transfers.
- The accused's perspective is that he should go scot free and the matter should not be blown out of proportion. He has connections and he might be thinking that he should be able to get away easily.
- From the constable's perspective, a case must be registered as he was caught with proof and also the boy tried to hinder a public servant from doing his duty. Letting off the boy will be a de-motivation for the constable and his department.
- From the minister's perspective, the boy must be let off even if it means misuse of authority and tarnishing his own integrity.

Conclusion

- Considering all these perspectives, SHO must register a case as letting him go would mean dereliction of duty. It would set a wrong precedent and go against service rules. There cannot be selective imposition of law. If he is forced to release the minister's son, he should take the order in writing.

Q2. Mrs Priya is posted as High commissioner of the Indian embassy in Australia. Implementing government programs and acknowledging achievements related to the Indian diaspora is part of her job profile. A media house has invited her to an event to launch a book, which is within protocol.

She accepts the invitation and reaches the venue only to find out that there's a person named Mr Maheshwar in the event who is a friend of the author. Mr Maheshwar is a proclaimed financial fraud declared by various agencies in India. He has a non-bailable warrant against him, and the government is taking steps to extradite him.

Presence of Mr Maheshwar has put Mrs Priya in a fix and indecision. Analyze the situation and explain the course of action to be taken by her. Below are some suggested options. Evaluate the merits and demerits of them-

- Talk to higher authorities in India and take action accordingly.
- Ignore Mr Maheshwar and attend the function.
- Leave function immediately and issue notice against publishing house.
- Talk with Mr Maheshwar and persuade him to return to India.

(250 words)

Introduction

- The case presents a situational dilemma for Mrs Priya as she has to maintain probity of her office and also fulfill commitment to attend the book launch. She is an ambassador of Indian aspirations and sentiments but also has to maintain professional ethics.

Main body

- Issues and values involved-
 - Avoiding public perception of crony capitalism.
 - Integrity to fulfill acceptance of invitation.
 - Ignorance of organisers for inviting Mr Maheshwar.
 - Respecting sentiments of people in India as fraud is against the whole nation.
 - Courage of conscience.
 - Probity of office.
- Merits and demerits of given options are-
 - Talk to higher authorities in India and take action accordingly-
 - Merits include actions taken as per protocol. No actions will be taken against Mrs Priya in future.
 - Demerits include delay in decision making process, delegation of responsibility and lack of prudence on part of Mrs Priya.
 - Ignore Mr Maheshwar and attend the function-

- Merits include making organisers of event not feeling embarrassed and upholding values of tolerance and temperance.
- Demerits include questions on the probity and courage of Mrs Priya and injustice to victims of Mr Maheshwar.
- Leave function immediately and issue notice against publishing house.
 - Merits include Mrs Priya being saved from personal embarrassment and precedent set for such organisers.
 - Demerits include embarrassment to organisers and the objective of connecting to the Indian diaspora will be defeated.
- Talk with Mr Maheshwar and persuade him to return to India.
 - Merits include less embarrassment to organizers and if Mr Maheshwar is persuaded, the process of extradition will be quickened.
 - Demerits include very less chance of the offender getting persuaded and it also makes the government look weaker.

Conclusion

- Considering all the above options, Mrs Priya should leave the function immediately and take up the matter with higher authorities. Leaving the function will save her from embarrassment and send strong warning to the offender. If persuasion is a viable option, it can be done later informally. But taking up the matter with higher authorities will also help coordinate with Australian authorities thus ensuring extradition as per law.
-

UPSCPREP.COM

Simplify your UPSC Journey



UPSCPREP.COM
Simplify your UPSC Journey

Write UNLIMITED

For 2 Months

Write answers to questions of your choice - We will evaluate them for you!

Course Link: [JOIN NOW](#)

Simplify your UPSC Journey